

## Total Supporting Submissions for Option 2 – 35

A modern, low maintenance building which does not need any earthquake strengthening.

There are already two meeting spaces, both with kitchen facilities.

There is already a side chapel which can be used alone for small services or can be an extension of the main church.

Can be financed mainly by the sales of Good Shepherd Hall and the Holy Cross site.

The church is close to the Kilbirnie centre and reasonably, but not ideally, close to transport links.

### St Patrick's church **meets the requirement for earthquake resilience**

The archdiocese excess buildings should be rationalised for pastoral care — excess land and buildings sold for community housing in partnership with the Wellington Council and central government.

Lay pastoral leaders should be accommodated in a live-in community in the archdiocese

All excess building should be sold and the proceeds used by the archdiocese for the greater good (especially paying off debt and building a sinking fund for essential property maintenance).

Our view is that this is the ONLY financially viable option

Creating worship spaces for very large numbers of people has to be seen in the context of the limited number of occasions in any one year when space will be filled

It is centrally located for the whole parish catchment

-It is the newest, warmest church

-450 people can be accommodated, so there's no need to expand (and aren't the walls movable?)

-It has parking

**-All bus routes go through Kilbirnie with bus stops very close by**

-It has links to the colleges

-it is popular for **Masses for regular events, such as the Tongan Mass, Assyrian Mass, priests' jubilee Masses, etc**

-Parishioners from Mt Carmel have already had to transition when that church was closed and it's unfair they are required to do so again

-It's the original church of the eastern suburbs celebrating 100 years

priest accommodation, offices and meeting rooms (which can be rented out) can be built above the carpark at St Patrick's

### **Adequate worship space 400+**

More than adequate parking options parish carpark, school play ground, council area and surrounding streets

I believe we should retain the current presbytery in Miramar. As the airport makes a physical and mental barrier for some people between the Miramar peninsular and the former Kilbirnie parish I think there should also be a worship space in Miramar

**Significant fundraising should not be an option** - money on buildings instead of people is not what we're being asked to do; also an aging congregation cannot sustain big fundraising efforts

Any and all excess land and building should be sold and the proceeds used by the Cardinal to pursue the mission of the church, preferably to re-envangelise the faithful so that the domestic church be an example to our neighbors that the teachings of Jesus Christ is real and the fruit of His teaching will be evidence in the daily lives and practice of the faithful.

Multiple-use church/halls are I think the best option to organise any new building, as it enables good use of the building and leaves more finance available for outreach. I have heard that St Brigid's church in Feilding is successful as a combined church and hall

**I support Option 2** because St Patrick's church already holds 450

I believe we should **retain the current presbytery in Miramar**. As the airport makes a physical and mental barrier for some people between the Miramar peninsular and the former Kilbirnie parish I think there should also be a worship space in Miramar

we have a good number of parishioners who attend masses regularly and really identify with the parish

- we have active and committed ministries in place
- we have ample parking to accomodate the demand for the number of regular mass goers

Parish centre can be enlarged by removing a wall to cater for large numbers.

- To enlarge St Patricks for the rare occasions to seat 450, the wall between the Foyer and meeting room can be replaced with Bi —fold or sliding doors to accommodate the larger number when required. Lockwood Housing would be able to advise.
- **St Patrick's Parish hall should be sold.** Unknown costs to earthquake proof. It is rarely used by the Parish and the school.
- **Good Shepherd should be sold and St Anthony's Church can be made available for the Samoan Community.**  
Holy Cross School can use their hall for Masses and Liturgies.

The renewal of structures demanded by pastoral conversion can only be understood in this light: as part of an effort to make them more mission-oriented, to make ordinary pastoral activity on every level more inclusive and open, to inspire in pastoral workers a constant desire to go forth and in this way to elicit a positive response from all those whom Jesus summons to friendship with himself

We must admit, though, that the call to review and renew our parishes has not yet sufficed to bring them nearer to people, to make them environments of living communion and participation, and to make them completely mission-oriented.

In my view it means **a shift in emphasis** from maintenance of our current resources and ways of doing things to an emphasis on mission which is in fact the very reason the Church exists in the first place.

Please note that this does not mean a complete neglect of maintenance but rather a **re-focussing** of physical, financial and human resources towards mission/evangelisation.

1. **Option 1 is too expensive.** Money should be being put into mission not buildings.
2. **Option 3 has too many unknowns.** Strengthening to 67% may not be sufficient in the medium to long term and who knows what further difficulties may be uncovered.
  - Holy Cross Church is concrete and not feasible to spend money strengthening it when it could still be considered dangerous even if upgraded.
  - 
  - Population centre of parish is in Kilbirnie area
  - It takes 8 minutes to drive from St. Anthony's to St. Patrick's [I have timed it]
  - Elderly or infirm people do not mostly walk to Mass. Once they are in a car it is not too far to St. Patrick's

The sale of the Holy Cross site would likely raise the money needed for any alterations to St. Patrick's and more importantly for training lay people for evangelisation, mission, liturgical service, service to the poor etc.

it is absolutely necessary that an **alternative venue be found for the Samoan Aulotu**

1. If St. Patrick's is to become the main church for the parish it would be good to have a multi-purpose cum prayer centre in both Seatoun and Miramar— maybe in conjunction with the Anglicans?

Would congregations increase because a new church is built? It is not the building that should draw people to church but it is what is in the hearts of people who attend

Option 3 strengthening of Holy Cross Church to 67% of seismic building code is a big risk as the seismic code could increase. The Parish would be throwing "good money after bad" if the code was to change. Also maintaining insurance would be costly.

St Patrick's Church was designed to hold 350 in the nave and 50 in the side chapel, making a total of 400 that can be accommodated. The side chapel has clear windows allowing unrestricted views into the main church and sound system is extended so that all audio at Mass can be heard in the chapel. There is seldom a need to accommodate more than 400 worshippers and some overflow can fit into the foyer and meeting room with sound from the nave extended there as well.

The area below the church that accommodates the parish centre, garage and storeroom has no internal supporting walls. It could be opened out to one large area at little cost and work. The costs of the above suggestions would fall far short of the 2 million suggested.

There is no need to spend a large sum on St Patrick's Hall. This hall has had practically no use by the parish in recent years. It is also little used by St Patrick's Primary School. It cannot be gifted to the school because it would be over-code and not allowed by the Ministry of Education under integration rules. The best approach would be to sell the hall and rid ourselves of this millstone.

1. **Plenty of parking** in the parking area, school playground and across Kilbirnie Crescent adjacent to the Recreation Centre. This particularly important for funeral attendance.

**Bus routes and stops are in close proximity.** No.2 from Miramar/Seatoun and No.14 from Hataitai - 110 metres. No.3 from Lyall Bay or Newtown direction — 100 metres. Pedestrian crossings on walking route

1. Within easy walking distance from Rita Angus retirement home.

**Prominence.** The church is viewed from across Kilbirnie Crescent from library, Recreation Centre and Regional Aquatic Centre. There is a clear view across the car-park but some work, such as attractive signage and a large cross, would be needed to make it more prominent from that view. The view coming down Crawford Road is good.  
Links to Schools.

**The church is located in the largest population area encompassing Kilbirnie, Lyall Bay, Melrose, Houghton Bay, Hataitai and parts of Roseneath.**

Attractive for youth activities with a welcoming church and Parish centre below

The Costs also require the sale of St Patrick's new car park for the sum of \$500,000. When the presbytery was to be demolished we were told that the land was part of the church property and would not be split off. The Building and land could have realised over a million dollars on today's market and it is suggested that we now sell it for half the amount after paying \$300,000 for demolition and restoration of the site; what folly. This would result in a net return of \$200,000 instead of the possible one million if it had been sold with the building

..Holy Cross/St Anthonys School requirements...

These schools' requirements can be met by using some of the money gained by selling property to convert St Anthony's church and Holy Cross School hall into suitable worship spaces.

We as a church need to look at the principles Jesus taught about the values he expects from his followers and base this around our church.

His church was to be simple,

The numbers of parish attendance will not expand greatly,... A brand new church Being in the center of Miramar is not going to fix that problem Many people perceive that the Catholic Church has far too much money and are put off by it.

To that end I wish to express the thought that whatever option is decided requires NO debt or fund raising. Because when I look around me at Sunday mass, and I see 60-70 people all over the age of 60— I begin to understand that there are so few following us that it would be unfair to saddle the next generation with significant debt or fundraising requirements just to suit our needs.

*I prefer a Church which is bruised, hurting and dirty because it has been out on the streets, rather than a Church which is unhealthy from being confined and from clinging to its own security. I do not want a Church concerned with being at the centre and which then ends by being caught up in a web of obsessions and procedures."* (Evangel Gaudium p49)

**Mass count** in Kilbirnie is around twice that of the other two centres put together. This is proved by the Archdiocesan Annual Statistics for at least the last 10 years. It doesn't make

any sense that the Centre of the Parish is located at such a distance from the population centre as the Miramar site.

Around \$860,000 is allocated for upgrade costs to the St Patrick's Church. The upgrades envisaged may not be necessary and we may not need to use all of this. The Church currently seats around 300 people.

The St Patrick's Hall could function very effectively as a base for Mission Outreach, as well as being used by the school. The hall measures 270sqM in area and a third of this could be partitioned off for parish use, giving 90sqM for the parish and 180sqM for use by the School. The partition between the two spaces could be folded back so that the Parish could have access to the whole 270sqM if needed at evenings and weekends for Parish meetings etc. A mezzanine would be constructed above the part used by the Parish, providing a Parish Office as well as a meeting and creative space for ministries. The downstairs part would be used primarily as a drop-in centre for those who need someone to talk to. This would be open (say) from 10.00 to 2.00 and pitched mainly to adults, and from 3.00 to 5.00 aimed at school kids..... The Hall has a much greater street-presence than the Church, (or even than the Miramar site) being in the main shopping centre for the Eastern Suburbs.

**Structurally, St Patrick's church is 100% sound, in terms of seismic requirements, and is on higher ground in the event of a tsunami**

Option 3 is more expensive for the parish in terms of annual maintenance. The current foyer, front driveway and meeting room are obvious places for extending the church to seat 450. The current Lockwood design makes extending so much easier.

In the immediate future the Capuchin priests could occupy the Seatoun house, and keeping St Antony's church in use could give an option for Miramar parishioners. If and when the Capuchins leave the Parish both properties could be re-assessed for sale.

We strongly advocate the **sale of St Patrick's hall**. It is seldom used, is old and tired and would not be needed with the re-development of St Patrick's church.

The document is silent on the fact that the parish has two secondary colleges and their needs from the parish and what they can offer by way of facilities

Greater effort needs to be made to retain Good Shepherd Hall for the Samoan Community; as well as being their church the hall is their community centre and options should be explored to gift or lease the hall to that community with the Samoans taking responsibility for upkeep and insurance.

1. At Good Shepherd there is a block of land of about 8.5ha. The report is silent on sale or use of this property. I am aware of past proposals for its development and, in the current

circumstances, options need further exploration and action

An opinion has been expressed that the churches or halls in Kilburnie and Seatoun could not be given or sold to the schools because it would take the schools over-code. Schools in other parishes around the country have thought innovatively about this and been successful in getting access to surplus facilities - e.g. \_designate the building as a gym rather than a school hall.

I am puzzled by the statement the Archdiocese would probably not agree to sell St Anthony's church because of proximity to the school - does this mean it will be boarded up, demolished or moved to another site?

The Kilbirnie site is adequately catered for parking and is close to bus routes, perhaps augmented by transport supplied by the parish on a Sunday.

The Miramar site appears to be the most valuable and would achieve the maximum revenue as a lease or for sale. A worship space at Holy Cross School would be highly desirable

There is no evidence given that siting the church in Miramar will increase parish participation and therefore gifting income.

Weekend parking consists of the new car park, the school playground and the library/swimming pool car park. Disabled are able to be driven right to the door. St Patrick's already has a capacity of 400.

St Patrick's is high profile bringing in people from Lyall Bay, Kilbirnie, Hataitai and Mt Victoria.

For those who need public transport people from Seatoun and Miramar are able to bus to Kilbirnie — Lyall Bay people would need two busses to go to Miramar

There is room for expansion.

In the event of no priest — ie a pool of priests servicing the Wellington area — it is more time/cost effective travelling to Kilbirnie

The Hall in Bay road could be sold if extra funds were needed to build a presbytery and conference facilities etc on the now vacant land next to the church.

Miramar church and surrounds could be leased for an approximate period of say 30 years. This would give extra income to the parish.

Sell St Anthony's Church, but **keep the presbytery as a source of income.**

I wonder if there is any need for 3 primary school so close together in the Eastern suburbs? St Anthony's school could amalgamate with Kilbirnie or Miramar school. This would enable the whole then to be sold.

If the proposal includes the sale of Holy Cross Church, Presbytery, Hall and Good Shepherd Hall then why would we retain St Anthony's Church? Is that fair and just?. How does that help us *'to serve those who are marginalised or disadvantaged'*?

How does this align with the terms of reference and the spirit of what Pope Francis is asking of us? Why would there be an emphasis on fundraising (Option One) when we have so many property assets?

The hall can be refurbished and serve as a quality venue for our Holy Trinity Parish and have the potential to generate some income for the parish. Both colleges are located in Kilbirnie. Public transport is not an issue. Public parking is accessible.

**Option Two is more financial feasible:**

It will require less use of existing funds (\$472,800 against \$1,699,680), while the cost is \$59,320 more, this will be offset by the \$8,000 less in operating costs.

Regarding the presbytery, since **Holy Cross Presbytery (Lot 60 Block III DP 1335) is a separate property to the church/hall (Lot 58 Block III DP 1335 and Lot 59 Block III DP 1335) it may not need to be sold, providing a central location for the priests.** The St Anthony's Presbytery (Lot 3 DP 54750) could be sold instead.

Option 2 is my preference as the church building doesn't need strengthening or replacing. With the upgrade it would accommodate the required number.

Although I have been a parishioner of Holy Cross parish for over 50 years, I prefer Option 2 .

- What is the figure of 450 seating capacity based on? Is that the total Sunday Mass attendance across all churches in the parish currently? Do we need one church that will accommodate everybody at the same time, especially given that there are other facilities in the parish for whole-of-parish masses (e.g. St Patrick's College hall)?
- What is the geographic distribution of parish members, i.e. where do most of them live and currently attend mass? It makes more sense to have one priest travel to the people than to have the people travel to the priest.
- I am strongly opposed to building a new church (even though a modern church would be nice). The focus of the parish should be on the community and not on buildings. The fundraising of \$3.8m (more likely \$5m+) could not be justified and would be very difficult to achieve.

Is it necessary to maintain St Anthony's Church on this option? Can it be transferred to the school as a hall? I support the variation to this option of transferring the St Patrick's Hall to the school and utilising the basement of the church.

What is envisaged by having St Anthony's (and possibly St Patrick's Church) as "multi-purpose facilities"? Could they be used as school halls as well as for school masses and for parish masses? Could they be transferred to the schools and used as their hall and for school masses? It is

inefficient to maintain buildings such as these multi-purpose facilities but under-utilise them as their maintenance costs are spread over less use.

- It would be good to coordinate with Wellington South Parish to see what their thinking is re churches and presbytery. These decisions should not be made in isolation.
- The Church is big enough as it is for 95% of the year.
- On other occasions St Patricks College Hall could be an option as on many occasions in the past.
- Accommodation for Parish Priest best talked about with central, Southern, and Eastern Parishes.

Kilbirnie church is designed in a semi circle. So this provides for the opportunity to create more of a sense of community, for this reason the Kilbirnie church does not need to be altered, at cost, in order to be fit for purpose.

**We need to create for future generations of the parish a faith community to belong to not a debt to be serviced.**

We are a small parish with a decreasing Mass attendance and aging parishioners with many having English as a second language.

Financially we have \$2.0m in savings but our weekly income is becoming less than our expenditure and our savings are slowly being degraded.

**Our current Mass count: St Patrick's 319 or 55% of total, Holy Cross 195 or 32% and St Anthony's 81 or 14%.**

Parishioners already contribute to our catholic schools and have no appetite to spend further large sums of money on these schools.

**The church is safe** (Lockwood 100% NBS), warm, modern, low maintenance, meets modern liturgy requirements, attached to a school with 2 Catholic colleges (1150 pupils) nearby. It can accommodate 400 including a side chapel and has room for future expansion if required. At 2019 confirmation there were 480 in the church

There is no requirement for a large hall and, if needed we would use a parish school/college facility.

The parish has recently spent \$300,000 to provide 32 car parks in the area of the old presbytery plus there are more than 40 parks available on weekends in the school grounds. Overflow parking is generally available at the Aquatic Centre/Library area

**St Patrick's large hall is surplus to requirements and should be disposed of (4-\$1.2m)**

Our current savings of \$2.0m is decreasing so we could add \$1.2m from the **sale of St Patrick's hall. We would not sell St Anthony's presbytery and use the \$1000 per week rental to bolster operational expenditure.**

**We should investigate the lease of the Holy Cross site either with or without buildings and this ongoing revenue would help to stabilise our steadily decreasing capital.**

By being financially sustainable we will be able to afford to employ a Lay Pastoral Leader and carry out the Cardinals directive to look after the marginalised and those in need of help.



The valuation report states that the best use of the Holy Cross site is for "re development". We should investigate the leasing of this total site either with existing buildings or just bare land

(upgrades to St Patricks....)This would provide a Church, possibly with a side chapel, capable of holding up to 450 people, with some upgrades to furnishings and systems. There would also probably be some changes to the basement rooms at the church, as a result of losing the current chapel and meeting room upstairs (to allow the church to accommodate 450).

If St Patrick is closed there is a high likelihood (for demographic, geographic and transport reasons) that parishioners living in Roseneath, Hataitai, Kilbirnie, Melrose, Houghton Bay, Lyall Bay and Rongotai will go west, not east, with the resultant reduction in parish income.

The church is capable of holding 500-odd people without any modification for the once-in-a-blue-moon occasion this might be required.

Provision of worship space at Holy Cross School:

- is the responsibility of the Catholic Schools Board, not the parish
- would be contrary to the Cardinal's directive to reduce property holdings.

Retention and upgrade of St Patrick's hall is not required as continued ownership of the hall is not necessary for the parish.

There is no need for the parish to own a hall as there are plenty of halls available for lease for the once or twice a year it might be used.

1. On the old St Patrick's presbytery site, using the above sale proceeds

Build one or two levels for car parks:

- rent them out Monday to Saturday - a lot of people work in Kilbirnie, a number of whom may well be prepared to pay a reasonable amount for secure, allocated, parking. Do it on the basis that the church has priority use and will give one day's emailed notice, plus refund when it is required for funeral, wedding or other church use.
- Set aside some parks for use by people attending weekday mass.  
Build meeting rooms on the next level
- parish offices
- sacramental, learning and social spaces
- rent the rooms out on an hourly/daily basis by businesses (plenty of businesspeople fly into Wellington for a meeting/seminar who don't want the hassle and expense of fighting their way into and out of the CBD)
- configure the rooms so that the majority can be opened out into one large space when required for youth groups, parish meetings or other use
- employ the parish secretary full time to attend to both the parish's needs and to manage the conference centre and car parking.
- if successful the car parking and conference centre may also provide cleaning, catering and other employment opportunities for parishioners.
- Build accommodation on the top level.
  - assuming the Capuchins stay with us, configure it as a friary

if/when the Capuchins leave for some reason reconfigure to provide separate accommodation for diocesan priests and/or a lay pastoral leader and family

- if it ever comes to a time we have no resident priest, deacon, lay pastoral leader it can be rented out - either commercially or as social housing

Surely it is a waste of money increasing capacity to cater for once-in-a-blue-moon special occasions, when that increased capacity will be unused 95% of the time.

The airport runway (see map) is a physical and sub-conscious mental barrier dividing the parish and is one of the reasons St Patrick was strongly opposed to amalgamating with Miramar and Seatoun in the first place. Parishioners' strongly preferred first option, based on demographics, geography, history and mass count was to remain as St Patrick. If the Cardinal was insistent on an amalgamation, the parish's second preference was to join with St Anne's.

Kilbirnie has a dedicated car park next to the church, the school yard is available outside school hours, there is plenty of off-street parking available across the road at the library/swimming pool complex.

A Key Goal would be to enhance the Income from St Patricks Hall.

- I would be interested to know how the figure of maintenance of \$14,000 per year was arrived at for St Patrick's - This has NEVER occurred so far so get your facts right!!!!

-Seats 400 - with the wide porch and meeting room taking any overflow

- Largest Mass in the 28 years was a funeral of 520 - everyone was in the church
- I am elderly, with no vehicle and on a walking stick. St Patrick's is a bus ride away. If Holy Cross is chosen I will be attending either St Anne's or St Mary's of the Angels as they are one bus ride away and therefore manageable

St Patrick's encompasses Roseneath, Hataitai, Kilbirnie, Lyall Bay, Melrose and Houghton Bay. If Miramar is chosen the Parish will lose a number situated in the above suburbs — they have stated this, which would have a devastating effect on how the parish is to continue

1. Two of our three children are about to begin college in Kilbirnie and we would prefer they have a church available for the college to use. Our third child may also be schooled in Kilbirnie in another two years from now before beginning college.

If a decision is made for Option 2 perhaps the presbytery (and office?) at Miramar could be retained? This would be closer to St Patrick's than the Seatoun presbytery and place the priest(s) more in the centre of the parish - in contrast to sharing a presbytery with priests in Newtown, for example.

## Downsides...

The Parish Centre beneath the Church will not function as a Hall. The maximum space available is 199sqM, that's if the existing store room (30sqM) is used. There is no other storage facility in the church building, so realistically we are likely to finish up with a Parish Centre measuring 169sqM in area including the existing garage, and with a 2.4M ceiling height

The downside of option 2 is siting of the presbytery that ideally should be close to the Church. Perhaps the proceeds of selling/leasing the Holy Cross site could be used to build a suitable new presbytery close to St Patrick's while maintaining as much parking as possible, possibly by going underground. It is also worth noting that increasingly across the Archdiocese more and more priests are living remotely from their churches and appear to be coping.

## Summary from Consultation Meetings for Option 2 - Francie and Colleen have "bolded" commonalities and points that align with those of submissions

*We also bolded in three options (as above) maybe key commonalities that came up regularly in some form, sometimes across all three options or in feedback etc*

- Make church more visible
- **More parking**
- **Accessibility** for elderly
- Highest demographic
- **least financial risk** (sell Miramar)
- good mix,
- **transport available,**
- carpark , better than option 3,
- **meeting room** under church
- Concern about St Anne's Church nearby
  
- **Cheapest option**
- **earthquake proof**
- warm
- 2 colleges involved here
- New, seats 450
- Low maintenance
- 2 carparks – street parking and pool area
- Population majority here

- **Church on 4 bus routes** – 2 stops within 1 minute
  - highest weekday Masses attendance
  - **two meeting rooms both with kitchens**
  - **accessible with ramp**
  - Meets all EQ 100%
  - New build
  - 2 million capital reserve
  - 400+ seats
  - Costing allows for additions / alterations to seat more
  - Save up to \$800 K
  - **Visibility** – not a thing
  - Central
  - 70 **carparks**
- 
- Transport an issue for the elderly and Seatoun people
  - Traffic!!
  - Unsure St Pat's could be adapted for 450 people
  - Too close to St Anne's
  - **Loss of HC – central, visible**
- 
- Prefers closeness to the Church for the elderly
  - Parking/ accessibility to HC a problem
  - St Pat's safe, comfortable, good access
  - 100% safe church
  - On bus routes
  - Larger catchment
  - CON: overcrowding of local area
  - New, small and central
  - Central to colleges and a primary school
  - **More financially sustainable**
  - Both have colleges nearby
  - **building is solid and sound**
  - Access is good
  - Spirit of Faith
  - Community
  - Prayerful
  - **St Patricks is fully resilient**
  - Change capacity to 400+ and retain St Patrick's
  - St Patrick's is a new modern Church
  - **Car parking** – Kilbirnie has better options