

Total supporting submissions for Option 3 - 12

The church **would be compliant** with the building code and therefore able to once again be used by the school and for any other liturgical events.

The site which is the most central and prominent of all the sites in the parish would be retained.

The **current presbytery would continue to house the priests.** It is a building suitable for up to four but can just as easily house one. If we are reduced to one priest in the future the other accommodation could be shared with priests from the neighbouring parishes.

If St Anthony's presbytery, Good Shepherd Hall and the Kilbirnie presbytery sites are sold there would be **less need to fundraise or put an additional burden on future parishioners.**

The site is close to the Miramar shopping area and to transport links.

1. The current Presbytery is adjacent to the church so there will be less distance for the priest to travel if that presbytery is retained.
2. The site is prominent; being over the roundabout from Miramar shopping centre.
3. Seatoun and Miramar parishioners will not have to travel to Kilbirnie.

have a floor in the Main Church,, thus making a warmer church, using the space upstairs for Office or Social gathering space and bring the altar to the middle , having circular setting and more a friendly gathering of us This would make the Church friendly and warmer but how much more, I would hope not too much.? My other thought was to take the old Hall out completely, upgrade a little of the Holy Cross School Hal for it's same use as now, and use the ground space for the extra Parking we need for this now MAIN CHURCH

I say 1st preference as my second preference would be to retain both Holy Cross and St Patrick's as two key Mass Centres in the Eastern Suburbs with upgrading to assist both sites to aid facilitating outreach, missionary activities as well as secure, multipurpose facilities which are scalable i.e. for both small and large gatherings aimed at culturally diverse groups as well as different age groups.

It is key the Parish undertakes further investigation as to whether it is feasible to run with one or two Centres this will take time with an end result not possibly known for another one or two years once further due diligence has been undertaken.

The link between the Church and Holy Cross School has been broken for too long now. It would be wonderful to get the children coming to the Church with the school. Numbers of Holy Cross School children worshiping on a Sunday have dropped dramatically since the earthquake rating stopped them coming with school and then parents were either worried or used that as an excuse not to bring their children on Sundays. We need to grow our congregation from the youngsters up. Holy Cross is a beautiful building. Why spend needless money building new when repairing is cheaper. Holy Cross is much more central. A new hall would encourage community involvement and could be a fundraising opportunity. There is already a house for priests.

1. Beautiful, well designed churches are crucial to have in our parish
2. These churches cannot be multi-purpose.
3. The demolition of Holy Cross Church and sale of the site would be an irreversible tragedy
By it's very nature, a church building should lead one's heart and mind to God. A well designed, beautiful church is one of the tools at our disposal to win souls over: it can increase faith and piety, and create a tendency to want to pray.

A building made to be comfortable and [social. eg.](#) the modern style circle shaped churches, creates many distractions. I won't be looking towards God when I am socialising in the church. I won't be honouring the Real Presence of Jesus in the Eucharist, when I am ignoring Him and instead looking around at others.

A church is a sacred space. Sacred means that it is set apart. it has a purpose: a single purpose, set apart for the worship of God. I would say that it is against the wishes of the Catholic Church for our churches to then be multi-purpose.

So if you do intend to make our churches multi-purpose, please clarify what this means, so that we can have fully informed discussion and discernment.

Finally, would you ever decide to demolish your home in favour of a new one, when you had no idea what the new one would be like? Of course not. Yet this is what parishioners are faced with, with option 1. I would love to have the opportunity to have a new church, but never without knowing the full plan.

Note that the upgrade and expansion of Holy Cross church is a possibility, and we welcome that. We expect that the presence of religious items, such as statues, stations of the Cross and Crucifix will be preserved, so that the visibly spiritual ambience within this sacred space is retained. The interior must look and feel like a church (– unlike St. Joseph's church, Mt. Victoria).

In order to make Option 3 more viable would it be possible to **sell the Kilbirnie hall** which in Option 2 would have to be upgraded, and divert the proceeds towards upgrading Holy Cross? Unlike Good Shepherd hall, **I** understand the Kilbirnie hall is **rarely used by the parish**. As well as proceeds from the sale there would be a big saving in upgrade costs. A smaller hall on the Miramar site might help to lower costs and allow for more parking space.

If Holy Cross is chosen as the main church, while the work of strengthening and upgrading was in process perhaps St Aidan's might allow some use of their church for Masses? (Or St Aidan's might let their church be used for Masses if Option 2 is chosen?)

In my opinion it is also beneficial to the Parish to maintain St Patricks and St Anthony's Churches as multi-use facilities. This would be of huge benefit to the students from the 2 Schools. Also, if Mass attendance trends reverse there will be the Churches to accommodate that.

I understand selling assets brings cash but I think if the parish can afford to it is best to **hold onto seatoun presbytery for safe guarding future**, might need more room for the school/classrooms or church. The property will also **provide good income**.

Downsides (predominantly from submissions supporting option 2)

The maintenance costs would increase as the building ages and, in time, I understand the roof will probably need replacing.

If St Anthony's presbytery is sold the rental income would be lost.

With reference to Option 3, I doubt if any upgrade of Holy Cross would solve the existing heating and acoustic problems and it would remain an inefficient use of space.

With Holy Cross sitting on a swamp, who knows what will be found once strengthening work (which apparently will only result in 67% of the current code) is attempted

Plus, there is no **parking** and people on bus routes 3 and 14 have to change buses in Kilbirnie to get to Miramar

1. The site was previously swampy. Has a geo-tech inspection been made to confirm that ground conditions are suitable for the proposed upgrade?
2. Unless a lot of further work is carried out the building will still be a long, high-ceilinged cavernous space that is difficult to heat. The layout is not conducive to modern liturgical requirements.

Car parking is minimal and difficult in local streets.

The nearest bus stop is 190 metres away with no pedestrian crossing over busy roads close to a major roundabout. Travel by bus from Lyall Bay or Hataitai would require 2 bus trips each way.

1. Links to schools. The site is not close to any Catholic schools with Holy Cross School being 340 metres away and the Colleges the other side of the airport. Pupils walking from Holy Cross School would have to cross a busy road with no pedestrian crossing.
2. **Parishioners from the largest demographic area centred on Kilbirnie will have to travel** to Miramar.
3. The congregation is remote from the altar especially towards the back of the church
4. Beyond the front rows some cannot see or hear, especially children
5. The huge sanctuary adds to the celebrant's remoteness from the congregation
6. There is no possibility of a day chapel, meeting / social rooms and discreet toilets
7. Parking and elderly access will always be difficult.

although this would be a central location for the parish (and next to the existing presbytery), it is quite an expensive option given the amount of upgrading required. Why is it necessary to build a new hall (there is a hall down the road at the school)?

The current roof to the main building is "fabric "and it may soon need a replacement which is estimated to cost an additional \$200,000.

Parking in the church grounds will be very **limited** and parking in surrounding streets is very difficult.

Holy Cross School is not adjacent to the church and is 400m away. This option has bus access from Miramar North, Seatoun, and Kilbirnie with a 190m walk but both need pedestrian crossing access.

As a catholic organisation **we cannot allow some of our parishioners to worship in a building with a low NBS standard**. The Cardinal has directed the parish to minimise the use of Holy Cross church and we are all aware that this rule has been breached in the past and is difficult to enforce—how many will be coming to a funeral?

Summary from Consultation Meetings for Option 3 - Francie and Colleen have “bolded” commonalities and points that align with those of submissions

We also bolded in three options (as above) maybe key commonalities that came up regularly in some form, sometimes across all three Options or in feedback etc From Consultation Meetings

- **Miramar Catholic Church is visible & central.**
- **Financially feasible**
- **67% not enough will increase in future**
- **Presbytery already in place**
- **HC presbytery is a good idea**
- **Carparking**
- **PARKING needs to be solved**
- **Parking is a problem at HC**
- visible – concerns over how?
- location is great
- So much has already been spent (sunk)
- It's the most affordable
- Could lower the roof to make it easier to heat
- new hall,
- central location,
- love carpark instead of new hall,
- hall at Holy Cross School,
- more functional, saves \$5 million to be available to “mission”, modernise and reconfigure layout to be warm and inclusive
- higher maintenance over time
- Holy Cross is too big & brings in no income

- Holy Cross should be made 2 stories of community facility. Upstairs could be offices. Putting in a mezzanine would make it easier to heat.
- Holy St Patricks would be the Parish Church and Holy Cross building would be the community social facilities
- Make Holy Cross two stories – office on top, church on ground floor
- Obscene to fundraise when we have poverty in our community
- Not sell Good Shepherd Hall - community centre
- Church never sell economic means leasing it - the Samoan community
- Visionary Missionary Disciples St Vincent -Sallies - soup kitchen – outreach-best site
- Practical / cost effective
- School/Church
- No mention of Colleges
- Holy Cross is Central – very visible
- Financially feasible
- works as a Catholic Church – God focussed
- close to Seatoun
- CONS: foundation (underground)
- on a bus route
- size of congregation?
- Smaller catchment area
- No direct bus routes to HC from Lyall Bay and surrounds
- Holy Cross (OPTION 3) is best – 2 in group
- It's still a big old Church – hard to heat
- Mass Counts???
- Ministry of Education – “gifting” buildings
- Presbytery – is it necessary to be located on the same site?

Prefer option 3 over option 1 because more likely hall and church are more integrated

OTHER- General concerns/Issues

- Other parish assets – transfer to schools
- Earthquake strengthening – ie is 67% enough

- Long term future of other churches
- Mass attendances
- Is St Patrick's Hall sale still an option?
- Ambitious
- Realistic
- Identified options
- Already a "Done Deal" anyway
- Agree selling Good Shepherd Hall
- Agree location at Holy Cross is the best especially for elderly people who catch the bus
- Want more parking spaces – all around the buildings
- Build the new hall first, can rent it when not using it; then build repair Holy Cross Church
- Divine Mercy Group wants to keep Holy Cross Church
- Pacific community needs use of Holy Cross Hall
- One person says we should be radical sell ALL our properties and do Option 1
- Four others agree we need to rent out our facilities to get income
- Acknowledge suitability for future diverse parish communities, esp youth and migrant groups
- Ensure structural and foundation sustainability
- Could rotate the one priest to the three Church sites on Sunday/vigil
- add missionary to social effects in 5th bullet
 - Sell St P hall, build a suitable hall in Rongotai Rd, if needed
 - people too busy to fundraise
 - St P Hall needs upgrade 43% to 67 % - opportunity to reconfigure
 - Compatibility with Wgtn Sth - not a thing
 - All:

- Need to take opportunity to start again
- Maybe consolidate into 1 Church first then decide
- Prefer new Church – build it to meet needs for future generations
- Churches struggling financially
- Raising 3 million too difficult
- Some:
 - Dislike for HC – as it is old fashioned and not conducive for involving the congregation
 - concern that the St Pat's and St Anthony's church buildings being retained, but won't get much use
 - Could the church building itself be used as a multi purpose facility for meetings etc when not in use for Mass? (But need to consider how you would protect the sacred objects like statues and stained glass)

+

- Costs will always increase
- Fundraising difficult
- St Anne's questionable – Kilbirnie is close to St Pat's
- Kilbirnie people may go to Newtown
- Anything spent on Miramar site is money spent on a less than perfect church
- Why seat 450? How many times a year will that happen?
- Traffic Miramar to and from Kilbirnie difficult at times or refit?
- Would the upgrade of HC include an interior refit?
- Is this change driven by costs mainly? If so why are we keeping so many buildings?
- Don't like selling old presbytery site under option 3
- What about Seatoun? It could be made bigger.
- Distances even from Kilbirnie not great. Everything is central in the Eastern suburbs
- Multi use in what way?

- We appear to be:

retaining all/ most of our resources

merely renaming- purpose

- 2 primary schools with clear advantages, yet HC is the biggest roll number
- Terms of Reference
- Pope Francis – How to do it differently
- Unknown variable – St Anne's outcome
- Fundraising is very hard
- Holy Cross Church is cold and unwelcoming
- Relocate office and presbytery to Seatoun (St Anthony's)
- Retain St Anthony's for cultural groups use
- Safety of HC children when using HC church
- Is the recommendation to the Cardinal going to be presented back to the parish first?
- Society and family life has changed an parishioner requirement for functions at halls not so common
- Transport options will be paramount