

It is difficult to be entirely rational when one has been associated with one church for a long time. At the meeting I attended, locals outnumbered the other two and parochialism showed through big time. That was totally understandable - the meeting was at St Patricks. No doubt the same happened at the Holy Cross and St Anthony's meets as well.

Comments I heard at the meeting I attended included 'that it would be just as easy to attend St Annes, St Josephs or St Francis', that Holy Cross was very old (questionable) and cold (easily remedied)'. There seemed to be a strong dislike for Holy Cross. I think the fact that the authors of the proposal indicated option 3 may have been a ploy to make sure the other two sites were well supported.

So I offer some thoughts that I see as important to the conversation.

1. That the Church is highly visible and centrally located. It must be a place of worship and dignity at all times and the interior very catholic looking — God's House. A sound proof 'crying room' for parents with small children should be provided. It cannot be a multipurpose structure.
 2. That those who live in the catchment area in the main do attend and support the parish church. I do not favour the churches of each parish be clustered close together.
 3. As a Parish we are blessed with three primary schools and two secondary schools, one of these with a chapel and the others all with hall space. Having our own schools is a huge asset for the faith. All schools seem to be both popular and well supported with enrolments. Perhaps some of these spaces could be used by the parish if outside school hours!
1. Being integrated schools though, could the Ministry of Education be able to object to this?
 1. Mass attendance at Holy Cross could be disrupted at the present time by earthquake strengthening requirements, which may or may not be keeping a lot of the school community away. I understand the primary school has more pupils than the other two.
 1. Substantial parking has to be available.

My first choice would be to extend St Anthony's out to the street to create a church to house us all. Why this one - the choice should be between St Patricks and St Anthony's due to the schools' connections to the churches. St Patricks is simply too congested for a large development so that leaves St Anthonys. Our schools are our lifeblood and we must ensure they are close to our church so that it is just part of their lives.

If we must build on the Holy Cross site then keep St Anthony's Church and St Patrick's church to allow the schools a spiritual and community base. If both churches could have the sanctuary screened off for times that it is used for other purposes, then could the St Pats' Hall be sold to help towards the cost of redevelopment.

- Can Good Shepherd land be redeveloped as housing from which the church retains the rental?
- The presbytery in Seatoun was built for priests to retire to - is there a partnership with the Archdiocese that could see this happen and then the parish priest be housed in the housekeeper quarters.
- Kilbirnie site should be used to build a retirement village as an investment for future income

Nevertheless, breaking the impasse requires collaboration and a willingness to move from a previously held view and trying something different. Most of all, it requires the fortitude to make a recommendation that everyone can live with, as opposed to 100% agree with

We are to embark on a new journey as one parish and this is an exciting new opportunity to be bold and create a new church complex that is fit for purpose in the 21st Century. Respectfully I don't think you have presented sufficient analysis of what "Fit for Purpose in the 21st Century" really looks like, other than a facility that can cater for a total capacity of 450 people.

You say that you have provisionally dismissed an option of building a new church and hall at the Holy Cross school site because it is not prominent enough? Concerning the strong parish opposition to moving the Miramar church to a new site and the effect, this would have on long term church attendance. Where is your analysis? Declining attendance is a reality that the church needs to address and it makes perfect sense to purpose-build a new multi-use facility on the Holy Cross grounds. There would be better off-street parking in the playground at Holy Cross than any of the other existing church sites and the church could be used by Holy Cross school the same way that St Patrick's and St Anthony's churches are used by the respective schools.

The Miramar church and hall must be demolished because they require such significant upgrading but the land should be retained by Holy Trinity Parish and leased. That way, the parish would be generating income off an asset which would future proof it. The Seatoun presbytery site could be developed but shouldn't be sold, as the sale of Good Shepherd Hall could partially fund a redevelopment on this site. Once these assets are sold and the settlement proceeds reallocated to a new project you will find yourself in the same situation, strapped for cash, further down the line.

If you are looking to only renovate then St Anthony's too has the room to expand and should be considered over Holy Cross simply because of its connection to the school, the availability of parking and easy access.

Wellingtonians are notoriously a transient people. They come and they go — especially at key Liturgical Seasons which, in itself is a problem for parish Liturgists. In 20 years' time who will we be as the St Anthony's people of God? Parking, comfort, access, transport, onset of dementia, time, are just some of the issues to address. Just one toilet is inadequate now for emergencies, ageing disabled parishioners, or energetic children. St George's, St. Christophers, St Aidans are all experiencing change. Maybe we can share some facilities, talents and love.

We need to stop putting all our efforts into keeping things "in house." We need to promote and work together with other Christian denominations to provide compassion and charity, to support St. Vincent de Paul as our National united Catholic effort, to establish ecumenical Bible Study groups, family guidance, Christian libraries of D.V.D's and books, praying for good media efforts like the Christian Broadcasting Association, promoting with excitement the good things Pope Francis, our Bishops and our organisations, other Christian organisations and Churches are doing for the Common Good.

The proposed option 3 that is preferred in the paper is a sensible response to the PPC objectives however in the process of the consultation a number of issues have become apparent that the original PPC objectives likely did not consider. This is a natural occurrence as any project is commenced, issues and unforeseen consequences emerge.

1. The people from the three areas of Kilbirnie, Miramar and Seatoun are very different and unifying them is likely going to be a long road and I suggest will not actually happen within the next 10 years or until we have a new generation coming through that are not so territorial.
2. The likelihood of our Kilbirnie parishioners heading over the hill to Wgtn South Parish if we make Miramar the main church location will negatively impact not only our numbers but many of the PPC objectives.
3. The need for a 450 seat church is overly ambitious and causes a distorted response, when a small reduction to 400 can save undue expense and make a solution more affordable and palatable.

I believe that we should be retaining our high value assets in Seatoun in particular, and we must consider our three parish schools potential usage of parish buildings in order that this will encourage them to participate in

the parish community in the future, after all our school pupils will be a large proportion of our church in the future.

Option 2a: Upgrade St Patrick's Church (a variation of proposed option 2) Option 2a would involve:

1. Minimal upgrading St Patrick's Church and Upgrading of the St Patrick's hall to meet PPC Ministry Assessment. This would retain the Church and side chapel, capable of holding up to 400 people (not 450), with some moderate upgrades to incorporate the parish office and some better facilities. There would be some upgrade to the basement parish centre. The hall would be upgraded to meet earthquake building code requirements (to 67% of Building Code seismic requirements). If the parish wished, the church could be renamed as "Holy Trinity Church".
2. Sell Good Shepherd Hall, Holy Cross site (including church, hall and presbytery).
3. Utilise Seatoun Presbytery for priests' accommodation or sell and acquire new priest accommodation at Kilbirnie.
4. Site the parish office at St Patrick's, either in the Church or the hall.
5. Maintain St Anthony's church Option 1 in parish proposal.
6. Provide small church/worship/meeting space at Holy Cross school site for local community and school use and masses. This building could be of similar size to the St Anthony's Church 250 to 260m² and continue to provide a base for local Miramar parishioners for week day masses and local events that can incorporate and interact with the school community.
7. Sale of property at Good Shephard (approx 40% NBS) and Holy Cross (Church 22% NBS & Hall likely under 33% NBS and dilapidated) results in a large amount of maintenance and upgrade costs removed. The remaining property is more easily maintained and in better condition and provides well for current use and also provides a good asset stock if future sales are ever required.
8. Existing funds not used for property and can be retained for mission as per the parish vision.
9. Maintenance costs are reduced as buildings that require most expense are sold.
10. We will not be continuing to put our parishioners at risk by using a 59 year old concrete church building that, even if seismically strengthened to 67%NBS, will still be an old structure requiring expensive ongoing maintenance and added costs for alterations due to the height and its concrete construction and it will never be as structurally "safe" as a lockwood or new timber framed building.
11. The future look of the parish is - all our parish schools will have access to a worship space on site and our local parish communities will maintain access to local worship/gathering spaces with interaction of the school communities.

I have also been wondering how our mission work is going to grow be simply decreasing the number of buildings. In a way, that is becoming more insular, less present in the community that we should be seeking to serve.

Retain all or part of the Miramar site - this must be the corner facing the roundabout i.e a street frontage - where we could present our Catholic mission, inviting, welcoming, evangelising. This centre would not have a sacred space (for now) as the mixed purpose is not permitted, the church (St Patrick's) and chapels/worship space will be at the schools. This multi-function centre (much scaled down) would be achieved by Moving Good Shepherd Hall to the site (Aulotu needs will be catered for). Provision of the **main Parish office**, drop-in centre, meeting rooms for Vinnies, Legion of Mary and other Parish groups would be built onto the front of GS hall, providing the much needed visibility and invitation to the community. It might also be possible to include a Vinnies shop front (providing income/rent whilst bringing together the "works" of the Parish).

Either re-jig the titles of the Miramar site, sell the St Columbans hall and Presbytery and provide for Priest accommodation in the new part of the building or retain the presbytery.

Being mindful of the fact we need to ensure we make the best use of the limited financial resources at our disposal and yet we need to ensure we have connected Schools, an Aulotu (apologies if this is misspelt) which can function as much as they do today, an outreach centre which is highly visible and accessible, a set of spaces available for other groups, prayer, bible study and so on, what can we do at Miramar to include all those factors.

I keep coming back to the prominence of the corner section at Miramar, and how if we were to go with a "hard Option 2" then that prime location will be lost to us forever. I am also mindful that in reality we need to face up to the fact the financial burden of building our main Church on that site is beyond us, and we do not want to leave that debt for our future generations.

Is there then a way we can continue to use that "corner" site for our purpose, and provide 'accommodation' for the various other Parish groups and activities?

Is there a way we can divide up that set of lots in a manner where we keep the corner, and maybe a section next to that (potentially either where the Hall is today, or along Miramar Avenue, and we sell the rest of that site?

On the corner would be our "outreach", clearly visible prominent and Catholic "Centre" which would include potentially the Vinnies shop, office, our Parish office(s), meeting rooms. Next to that building we could move the current building from Good Shepherd Hall and continue to have that for use for our Aulotu and potentially also for hire. It can be used for other activities as they arise, for example for the Vinnies Xmas appeal and so on. The GSH site itself can then be sold off to help with funding

My suggestion would have the St Patricks Church as our main Mass Centre, although I am still confused over its capacity as depending on who you ask it is anywhere from 300 to in excess of 500! What about Holy Cross School? Well we have the option of either including in our corner site a Chapel, or using the GSH hall, or building (as suggested) a Chapel space on the Holy Cross School site. Money allowing I would be keenest on the last of these.

Considerable effort would need to be in evidence to support our aging community to get to Mass, and to help with Parking at Kilbirnie. I think on that front we can NOT rely on public parking areas such as the Kilbirnie Rec Centre and Pool, as often there are activities going on at those facilities and the Parking is at a premium. Rather, I think we need to work with St Catherines college to see if we can use Parking on their site (for our 'younger' Parishioners).

Below from Celeste Hastings, Holy Cross School Principal

In a letter sent to you in 2017 a deep desire to have the church (or sacred space) and school on the same site was outlined,

"We would... like to record our unanimous support for having Holy Cross Church on the school site so that we could become an integral part of the Holy Trinity Parish enabling us to work together to nurture the faith journey of each of our families and facilitate a reconnection between church and school.

Children and young families are the future of our church and we wish to support them to find their place within the church- this we know to be in keeping with the discussions at the recent Synod and, we believe the vision of our Cardinal and Pope.

The reality of having a church or sacred space onsite would not only be a visible sign of unity and collaboration but would present a daily 'invitation' to our students and their families to be part of this. For many of our pupils, school is their only experience of a faith community; having the church as a physical part of a parish /school complex would add an extra dimension to the worshiping side of the Catholic faith (rituals and traditions). This would help to give the students a more natural experience and a wider view of a 'faith community'.

We have heard of a successful precedent being set in the Nelson with shared church and school facilities; we are motivated toward such an initiative, to explore possibilities for growing the Church for tomorrow.

(end of Celeste's extracts)

St Anthony's Board...

- A primary concern of taking St Anthony's away is the loss of connection between the school and the Parish. This loss will certainly detract from the faith journey of our students and their connection to the Catholic faith as it is now. The Church is very much an integral part of day to day school life for our students.
- One class attends Mass with the parishioners each week. ...This is vitally important to the children's sense of belonging and community, and is said to be a great source of enjoyment for the parishioners
- ...whole school/community masses each Feast or celebration day
- ..The school conducts its whole school assemblies in the Church three a term....In addition to assemblies, the Church/Gascoigne room is frequently used for a variety of other whole/part school gatherings, such as music and drama practice/classes throughout the school weeks.
- ... alternate years to hold the ever successful bazaar. The bazaar raises a great deal of funds which is shared equally by the school and Parish, but more importantly preserves a sense of united community
- In the event that the Church and/or presbytery were to be sold, either would have a significant impact on the students wellbeing and future viability of the school. The school's outdoor play areas are already limited with no lawn or grassed play area.
- If the land were to be sold, there is every chance that the Church/presbytery may be sold to a private family/developer in the future with the potential of the land being claimed back to the new owners...
- There is no other land feasibly available to the school to replace the loss of the church/presbytery land.
- The Archdiocese is currently investing in upgrading St Anthony's School junior block to provide a modern learning environment.
- If the Parish decides St Anthony's is to continue to be a place of worship, allowing the school to utilise this space in various ways such as connecting with the parish community, continuing to hold our own school masses & events, and for other educational uses, it would enable the continued enhancement of the catholic faith journey of not only our current students, but for generations of students. It is vitally important to the growth of our school and the Holy Trinity Parish that St Anthony's remains a place of worship.

[End of St Anthony's Board submission]

1. Maybe there is an interim position where the decision around which is best single church option for Holy Trinity is delayed for a few years. This would entail spending enough money to get Holy Cross up to satisfactory earthquake standard and keeping St Patricks as is. St Ants presbytery would be sold. I prefer this option as it gives us options in future but does make a significant change in not having St Ants as a Sunday Mass church and sale of presbytery and Strathmore sites would generate useful funds.

My preference is to make St Anthony's the main church of the parish. I say this in all seriousness and urge the council to be bold in their thinking and seriously consider this. Yes it is a little further than Holy Cross for those living on the Kilbirnie side of the airport but really as outlined above it is another three minutes drive. Also I heard from a number of 'Kilbirnie' people that if Miramar was the preferred option they would go to Newtown which I can see makes some sense from their point of view. I know that no decision has been made about the adjoining parish but it is very hard to see St Anne's not being used.

St Anthony's is a lovely intimate church. It is a wonderful place for worship and prayer in ways that neither of the other two churches are. Surely that can't be argued? I like that it is generally more quiet in the areas surrounding the church, and it is a prominent landmark in Seatoun.

I expect St Anthony's could be extended out to the east if its size is considered an issue, and I expect this would be cheaper than the other proposed building options as it would be on the same level and flat ground. The choir can be utilised and I note that St Anthony's has held its share of large masses and funerals like all other churches.

The one thing which I would like more clarification on is exactly what St Anthony's and St Patricks would be used for if HC is the preferred option? Will there still be masses there?

- a. What are other Christian churches planning for the Eastern Suburbs? What overlap and gaps are there in our/their visions? What opportunities are there for joint effort?

Remaining comments taken from letter from the Samoan Aulotu

Firstly our main need is to be able to have a church available for our monthly Samoan Mass which is normally held on the first Sunday of each Month

Secondly we have Sunday school/youth running every Sunday morning from 9am - about 10:15am to give kids time to make it to Mass @10:30am which is normally held at St Anthony's Church.

We also have White Sunday practices that begin normally from September till the actual day which we normally celebrate on labour weekend.

Our children would need a hall space to be able to practice during the week and most weekends leading up to their White Sunday.

Lastly we need a meeting place where we can hold cultural customs especially when it comes to funerals. We have been using Good Shepherd hall for 40 years to host families and meetings. For our families and friends to pay respects and be able to spend final days with their loved ones.